Michael K. Jeanes, Clerk of Court

*** Electronically Filed ***

05/15/2013 8:00 AM

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA MARICOPA COUNTY

CR2010-007912-002 DT 05/03/2013

CLERK OF THE COURT

HONORABLE JOSEPH KREAMER

S. Yoder Deputy

STATE OF ARIZONA KIRSTEN VALENZUELA

HILARY L WEINBERG

v.

ELDRIDGE AUZZELE GITTENS (002) SUSAN L COREY

PETER JONES

CAPITAL CASE MANAGER

EXHIBITS-SCT

ARGUMENT ON MOTION TO DISMISS THE DEATH PENALTY RULING

Courtroom SCT 5B

1:39 p.m. This is the time set for Oral Argument on Defendants' Motion to Dismiss the Death Penalty (*Furman* Motion). The following parties are present in the listed cause numbers:

CR2009-160953-001 State: Marischa H. Gilla for Jeanine M. Sorrentino

Rudolph John Cano, Jr.: Defense: Bruce E. Buck

Presence Waived

CR2010-007882-001 State: Jeannette Gallagher

Jasper Phillip Rushing: Defense: Victoria E. Washington and Terry L. Bublik

Present

CR2010-007912-001 State: Kirsten Valenzuela and Hilary L. Weinberg Darnell Reuna Jackson: Defense: Alan I. Tavassoli and Andrew Clemency

Present

Docket Code 005 Form R000A Page 1

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA MARICOPA COUNTY

05/03/2013 CR2010-007912-002 DT

> CR2010-007912-002 State: Kirsten Valenzuela and Hilary L. Weinberg

Defense: Susan L. Corey and Peter Jones Eldridge Auzzele Gittens:

Present

CR2010-048824-001 State: Kristin Larish

Defense: Robert E. Reinhardt and Peter Jones James Clayton Johnson:

Present

CR2010-168096-001 State: Hilary Weinberg for Vince Goddard

Defense: Steve B. Koestner and Toby C. Schmich Craig Michael Devine:

Present

CR2011-005473-001 State: Hilary L. Weinberg

Abel Daniel Hidalgo: Present Defense: Bruce E. Buck and Toby C. Schmich

CR2011-008004-001 State: Hilary L. Weinberg for Vince H. Imbordino Defense: Steve B. Koestner and Bruce E. Buck Dennis Michael Levis:

Presence Waived

CR2011-008004-002 State: Hilary L. Weinberg for Vince H. Imbordino

Thomas Michael Riley: Defense: Michael G. Bailey

Presence Waived

State: Erica Basta CR2011-133622-001

Jesus Busso-Estopellan: Defense: Thomas E. Glow, Jamie Hindmarch; Knapp

Presence Waived counsel Michael Terribile

CR2011-138281-001 State: Jeannette Gallagher

Jason Neil Noonkester: Defense: Susan L. Corey and Peter Jones

Present

CR2011-140108-001 State: Kristin Larish

Defense: Thomas E. Glow and Steve Koestner Jose Alejandro Acuna

Valenzuela: Present

CR2011-150239-001 State: Jeannette Gallagher for Patricia L. Stevens

Ryan William Foote: Defense: Dawn R. Sinclair and Eric G. Crocker Present

Form R000A Docket Code 005

Page 2

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA MARICOPA COUNTY

CR2010-007912-002 DT

05/03/2013

CR2011-151833-001 State: Marischa H. Gilla for Stephanie D. Low Jonathan Ray Cole: Defense: Quinn T. Jolly and Gregory Navazo

Presence Waived

CR2012-007399-001 State: Marischa H. Gilla

Zachary William Baxter: Defense: Jamie C. Hindmarch and Rosemarie Pena-

Presence Waived Lynch

CR2012-139607-001 State: Kristin Sherman

Justin Otis McMahan: Present Defense: Victoria E. Washington and Garrett Simpson

CR2012-154880-001 State: Marischa H. Gilla for Neha Bhatia

Manuel Antonio Gonzalez: Defense: Jamie C. Hindmarch, Rosemarie Pena-Lynch

Presence Waived and Michael Terribile

Court Reporter Laura Ashbrook is present.

A record of the proceedings is also made by audio and/or videotape.

Procedural issues are discussed.

The Court affirms its January 25, 2013 ruling on the equal protection argument.

Discussion is held regarding Defendant Gittens' Request for Findings of Fact and Orders. For the reasons stated on the record,

IT IS ORDERED denying the Request for Findings of Fact and Orders.

Argument is presented on the Motion to Dismiss the Death Penalty.

The Court finds that Defendants have not presented enough evidence for the Court to overcome the strong presumption that the statute is constitutional.

For the reasons as more fully stated on the record,

IT IS ORDERED denying the Motion to Dismiss the Death Penalty.

The Court will issue a written ruling setting forth its reasoning.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA MARICOPA COUNTY

CR2010-007912-002 DT

05/03/2013

FILED: Exhibit Worksheet (under CR2010-007912-002, Gittens).

2:56 p.m. Matter concludes.

This case is eFiling eligible: http://www.clerkofcourt.maricopa.gov/efiling/default.asp. Attorneys are encouraged to review Supreme Court Administrative Order 2011-140 to determine their mandatory participation in eFiling through AZTurboCourt.